THE MULTIPLE REALITIES OF MULTIRACIALISM UNPACKED: RECONSIDERING CONVENTIONAL WISDOM IN THE MANAGEMENT OF ETHNIC RELATIONS IN SINGAPORE

A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE

STANFORD PROGRAM IN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL STUDIES

AT THE STANFORD LAW SCHOOL

STANFORD UNIVERSITY

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF THE SCIENCE OF LAW

By

Eugene Kheng Boon Tan

May 2004
ABSTRACT

How has the policy of multiracialism evolve in Singapore and how has its operation in key areas of Singapore life impacted on ethnic relations in a secure but vulnerable island-state? The thesis attempts to distill the thematic essence of state policy, the practice and rhetoric of multiracialism in the light of the imperatives of a sophisticated, authoritarian developmental state. The thesis challenges the conventional wisdom that multiracialism in Singapore as being race-blind or non-ethnic in its approach.

It proposes that Singapore is an ethnic-conscious state wherein race, culture, and language are mobilized as key resources in state-building, nation-building, and to enhance the regime security of the ruling People’s Action Party. Institutions and policies that are framed as promoting multiracialism have either ethnic/racial enhancing or polarizing dimensions within them.

Although the policy of multiracialism contributes to ethnic stability, key institutions of state and state policies have the unintended effect of heightening ethnic consciousness and impeding the nation-building process. This heightened state of ethnic consciousness can potentially engender inter-ethnic competition, insecurity and fear about an ethnic group’s cultural, and religious security.

Despite the prevalent ethnic harmony and stability, inter-ethnic dialogue is confined to the elite level and is superficial at the grassroots level. The government’s top-down control of all key institutions pertaining to issues of race and religion has stifled the development of genuine inter-racial grassroots organizations that could generate cross-cutting cleavages and develop social capital. This stunted state of development could undermine the sustainability of the multiracial framework in Singapore.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ABSTRACT** ........................................................................................................... ii

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ........................................................................................... iii

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION:**
THE MULTIPLE REALITIES OF MULTIRACIALISM .................................................. 1
Peace, Stability, and Economic Development ......................................................... 2
The Multiracialism Discourse .................................................................................. 3
Overview of Thesis – Questions, Arguments, and Approach .............................. 5
Outline of Thesis ....................................................................................................... 7
Working Definitions ................................................................................................ 9
Some Notes on Methodology .................................................................................. 10

**CHAPTER 2: RACE AND MULTIRACIALISM AS A MODE OF GOVERNANCE IN SINGAPORE.** ...................................................................................... 16
Multiracialism – Unpacking the Ideology ................................................................. 17
- *The Axiom of Faith Elaborated*
- *The State, Society, and Multiracialism*
- *The Dominant Discourse of Multiracialism*
The Salience and Instrumentalism of Race in Singapore ...................................... 22
- *The Imperative of Race Ascriptiveness*
Characterizing the Singapore’s Ethnic Regime .................................................... 25
- *State Corporatism*
- *Ethnic Stability via the Authoritarian Way and the Rituals and Reminders of Ethno-Violence*
- *Maintaining Ethnic Equilibrium in a Time of Baby Bust*

**CHAPTER 3: INSTITUTIONALIZING MULTIRACIALISM:**
THE LEGAL, INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK &
THE PERIODIZATION OF ETHNIC RELATIONS .................................................. 37
Entrenching Multiracialism:
Of Rights(-Abhorrence), (Pre-Emptive) Strikes, and Institutional Design ............ 37
The Constitution ....................................................................................................... 41
Presidential Council for Minority Rights .............................................................. 44
The Legal Framework ............................................................................................ 48
MANAGEMENT OF ETHNIC RELATIONS IN SINGAPORE – A PERIODIZATION
Phase 1: A Putative Singaporean-Singapore Identity (1965-1979)...............................49
Phase 2: Hyphenated-Singaporean: A return to genealogical roots (1979-1990).........53
Phase 4: Emphasizing Common Space in Overlapping Circles (2000-present)........60
Conclusion.............................................................................................................63

CHAPTER 4: ELECTORAL POLITICS: ELECTING RACE
CONSCIOUSNESS?...............................................................................................65
Multiracial Electoral Politics..................................................................................65
Electoral Integration through the Group Representation Constituencies..........69
   The GRC Mechanism
   Operational Realities of the GRC Mechanism
The Ethnic Integration Policy –
Dispersing the Electoral Incentive for Multiracialism?........................................75
   The EIP Mechanism..........................................................................................77
   Assessment of the EIP and its Implications for the GRC scheme....................78
Alternative Means of Achieving Multiracial Representation..............................80
Enervating Multiracialism.....................................................................................81
The Chinese Vote-bank and its Electoral Expression............................................84
Conclusion.............................................................................................................86

CHAPTER 5: THE CITIZEN’S ARMY:
THE DILEMMAS OF FAITH, LOYALTY, AND CITIZENSHIP.................................88
Of Trojan Horses and Differentiated Citizenship..................................................88
The Ethnic Manpower Policy – Security in Vulnerability......................................90
Of Trojan Horses, Loyalty, and Citizenship Ambiguity.........................................93
The Discourse of Meritocracy, Rhetoric, and Loyalty.........................................95
Multiracialism and the Military...........................................................................97
Conclusion.............................................................................................................101

CHAPTER 6: THE ESSENCE OF SELF-HELP &
THE DILEMMAS OF ETHNIC ESSENTIALISM......................................................103
Ethnic Self-Help: Whither the Commitment to Multiracialism?.........................107
Recalibrating Ethnic Self-Help.............................................................................109
The Fuzzy Logic of Ethnic Self-Help...................................................................111
Conclusion.............................................................................................................115